this organisation or that organisation, left and right and say that you are wrong and we are right and things like that. Information about the activities of this organisation is known to the hon. Members and we are in a position to form our opinion in a correct manner and we have formed our opinion in a correct manner and we will be careful and we would like to be effective also.

Delay in finalisation of Defence Plans

*382. SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA:†
SHRI HARISH RAWAT:

Will the Minister of DEFENCE be pleased to state:

(a) whether it is a fact that the finalization of Tenth Defence Plan was delayed;

(b) if so, the reasons therefor;

(c) whether Government have taken cognizance of the media reports apprehending delay in Eleventh Defence Plan too;

(d) if so, does Government agree with media reports;

(e) if so, reasons for the delay;

(f) whether it is a fact that inter-service rivalry has been one of the causes of delay in finalizing the Defence Plans; and

(g) if so, what steps are being taken to finalise the Defence Plan in time?

THE MINISTER OF DEFENCE (SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE): (a) to (g) A Statement is laid on the Table of the House.

Statement

The Tenth Defence Plan projections were formulated by the Ministry of Defence and an overall Plan size was accepted by the Ministry of Finance in December 2004 subject to the actual allocation for Defence being dependent largely on resources available with the Government at the relevant point of time, capacity to utilize funds, pace of expenditure, contractual agreements and other committed liabilities.

The Government is aware of the media report apprehending delay in finalization of Eleventh Defence Plan but does not agree with the

† The question was actually asked on the floor of the House by Shri Santosh Bagrodia.

apprehension. Any apprehension at this stage would be unfounded as Eleventh Plan is to commence from 1.4.2007 and the Ministry of Defence has already formulated the Plan size after detailed discussion with the Services and HQ IDS and sent it to the Ministry of Finance.

SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA: Sir, generally there is a very strong feeling that the total budget spent on Defence, which is less than 3 per cent of the GDP or 18 per cent of the annual Budget, is much lesser. Despite this, in the first two years of the Tenth Plan the allotted funds were not spent. As a result of it, is it true that IAF's combat capability will suffer crippling blow by next year, as its strength will come all time low to 29 Squadrons. If so what steps are being taken to maintain combat preparedness of IAF, considering that LCA is likely to be inducted only by 2012 and that the negotiations for proposed purchase of 126 Combat Aircraft are unlikely to conclude by next year?

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: Sir, the question relates to the Defence Plan, the Tenth Plan and the Eleventh Plan. Improvement of the Indian Air Force or the Navy or the Army in respect of the Plan are the components, but the basic question and all the questions are related to the Tenth Plan and Eleventh Plan. So far as augmentation of the aircraft and fleet is concerned, it is under constant review and we have taken steps. We have answered questions raised in this House that we have made elaborate plans for the augmentation of the Indian Air Force fleet.

SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA: Sir, my second supplementary is, just now in the first question we discussed the security problem in the country and integration of civilian sector with the military sector. Does the Defence Plan also take into account the threat to internal security due to continuing low intensity warfare that is being sourced from across the borders? If so, is the Defence Doctrine being reoriented accordingly for a better coordination with internal security agencies?

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: No, Sir, I am afraid this cannot be accepted.

श्री सभापति: ठीक है, ठीक है, आपने नो कह दिया।

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: The Armed Forces are basically meant to protect the borders and to protect the country from any external aggression. So far as internal security is concerned, it is essentially the job of the internal security forces. But in some extraordinary situation

when the internal security authority requires the help of the Armed Forces, the Armed Forces render their help. But it would be, to my mind, not at all a healthy development if the Indian Armed Forces which deserve respect and appreciation of all sections of the country, are engaged in the internal security, and going to the extent of revising its doctrine, I am afraid, this cannot be accepted.

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: धन्यवाद सभापति जी। महोदय, रक्षा मंत्री जी ने अपने लिखित उत्तर के प्रथम पैराग्राफ में दसवीं रक्षा योजना के बारे में कहा है कि: '...that an overall Plan size was accepted by the Ministry of Finance in December 2004 subject to the actual allocation for Defence being dependent largely on resources available with the Government at the relevant point of time, capacity to utilise funds, pace of expenditure, contractual agreements and other committed liabilities.'

सभापति जी, मैं आपके माध्यम से मंत्री जी से यह जानना चाहती हूं कि आपके इस उत्तर के अनुसार जिस समय वित्त मंत्रालय ने इस योजना को स्वीकार किया था उस समय पांच चीजें भविष्य के गर्भ में थीं, — कितनी धनराशि उपलब्ध होगी, उस राशि को इस्तेमाल करने की क्षमता कितनी होगी, व्यय की गति क्या होगी, करारों की स्थिति क्या होगी, आदि-आदि। आज अगस्त, 2006 समाप्त होने जा रहा है, यानी पौने दो वर्ष बीत चुके हैं तब से। मैं आपसे केवल यह जानना चाहती हूं कि जो प्रोजक्शंस उस समय दसवीं रक्षा योजना में किए गए थे, आज पौने दो वर्ष बाद वे किस हद तक पूरे हुए हैं?

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: Sir, I am afraid that we are nowhere near the target which we wanted to have. So, far as the Tenth Plan is concerned, hon. Members are aware that the Tenth Plan began from the 1st April, 2002. It will come to an end on 31st March, 2007. Therefore, whenever the Plan projections are being made, whether it is in the civil area or in the defence area, these are projections and these are estimates, and while making the estimation, every Finance Minister has to take into account whatever resources would be available. We make a computation but this is nothing but estimation. That is why every year we give Budget Estimates and the Revised Estimates. Nonetheless, these are estimates and at the end of two years, in the third year we give the actual figures. Therefore, all those five criteria, which the Finance Minister gives, it was given by the previous Finance Minister and every Finance Minister will have to give the criteria on the availability of the resources because you are making a plan for full five years and you are estimating the resources, estimating the resources on the development of GDP, on the development of industrial, on the development of activities and revenue mobilisation, on the estimated rate of inflation. During the five year period, these may

change. Therefore, the resource projection may change. So, it is always that some sort of an element of uncertainty prevails. What happened during the Tenth Plan period? Specifically, the first proposition from the Ministry of Defence went on 19 December 2001 and they wanted to know from the Finance Ministry as to what would be our Tenth Plan. It was in the month of December. They got the response on the 1st of January 2002 that your Tenth Plan size would be Rs. 4,21,401 crores. Then the Defence Minister wrote back, in the month of March, 2002 that 'look, this is a small amount, we want Rs. 4,61,125 crores. You are giving me Rs. 4,21,000 crores. 'I want Rs. 40,000 more'. But no response came from the Finance Ministry.

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: सर, मेरा सवाल ही नहीं है। ...(*व्यवधान*)...

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: Yes, this is the sawaal.

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: सर, यह मेरा सवाल ही नहीं है। मुझे लगता है कि मैं मंत्री जी को सवाल समझा ही नहीं पाई। मैने उन पांच क्राइटेरिया की आलोचना नहीं की है। ...(*व्यवधान*)...

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: I admit that my knowledge in Hindi is poor. This is what I got from the translation.

SHRIMATI SUSHMA SWARAJ: No, Sir, I never criticised these five criteria. I only wanted to know from you because in December 2004, these were the projections. Now, almost two years are going to be over. I only wanted to know to what extent these projections have been achieved? *(Interruptions)* Only that much I wanted to know.

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: I am coming to that figure.

SHRIMATI SUSHMA SWARAJ: No, but I never criticised these five criteria.

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: That figure is Rs. 3,62,000 crores plus against Rs. 4,18,000...

SHRIMATI SUSHMA SWARAJ: This is what I wanted to know.

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: No, you must also know the fact, the fact of the matter is, because it is the five-year figure and when the projection for the Tenth Plan was made in December, 2004, half of the Plan period was over. Half of the Plan period was over and the Plan was not finalised. That is why what we got in the first two years...

SHRIMATI SUSHMA SWARAJ: I know that. In 2002, I was in the Ministry when the Plan started. I never asked why.

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: That is why what we got in the first two years... No, you should know these figures; the House should know these figures.

SHRIMATI SUSHMA SWARAJ: But don't pass the buck on the NDA Government. I never criticised those five criteria.

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: In the first year we got Rs. 56,000 crores. In the second year, we got roughly about Rs. 60,000 crores. In the third and fourth, we got Rs. 77,000 crores and Rs. 83,000 crores. For the current year, we got Rs. 89,000 crores and even if Rs. 89,000 crores is being spent because of the serious backlog of the first two years, we will not be able to reach Rs. 4,18,000 crores. We will be reaching only Rs. 3,62,000 crores plus.

श्री अमर सिंह: धन्यवाद सभापति महोदय। सर, मैं आपके माध्यम से माननीय मंत्री जी से जानना चाहता हूं कि क्या यह सही है कि रक्षा मंत्रालय द्वारा हथियार खरीदने के बारे में कोई ठोस निर्णय नहीं लिए जाने के कारण वर्ष 2005-06 के रक्षा बजट में से 2500 करोड़ रुपये वापस कर दिए गए हैं? यदि ऐसा है, तो उसका विवरण क्या है? मैं माननीय मंत्री जी से यह भी जानना चाहता हूँ कि यह लापरवाही क्यों हुई और इस 2500 करोड़ रुपए के इस्तेमाल नहीं करने की जिम्मेदारी किसके ऊपर है तथा इसके क्या कारण हैं? ऐसी घटना आगे नहीं हो, और डिफेंस प्रिपेयर्डनेस में कोई कोताही नही बरती जाए, इसके बारे में सरकार की नीति क्या है और उसका क्या विवरण है?

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: Sir, so far as the annual allocation for 2005-06 was concerned, it was Rs. 83,000 crores and at the RE stage expenditure was Rs. 81,700 crores. Therefore, the shortfall was not Rs. 2,500 crores, it was a shortfall of Rs. 1,300 crores. This shortfall took place due to certain contracts were signed at the last moment. Normally it happens and the hon. Member is aware of it. And, as the deadline-- 31st March -- was crossed, the contract could not be materialised and the planning could not be made. That is why Rs. 1,300 crores could not be spent. But, I do hope, in this year, we will be able to spend the entire amount. Rather, we may ask the hon. Finance Minister for some additional supplementary demand, because the trend of expenditure is a little more.

So far as the Defence procurement procedure is concerned, both on the revenue account and on the capital account, it is placed on the website and the hon. Members are fully aware of this. There are certain anomalies. It is a constant exercise to correct those anomalies.